

THE CONTINUED SCOURGE OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN NIGERIA: A CASE OF AN EFFECTIVE LAW ENFORCEMENT

-Dr. Alaka Oladipo, Inemesit Udongwo and Memabasi Udowoima

INTRODUCTION

In a globalized world that has left the world ‘a global village’, it is not unexpected that people move all over the world from rural to urban areas and from third world countries to developed countries. Some are fortunate to secure genuine new employment to aid their migration, however many others are forced into jobs they have not chosen voluntarily. Nigeria is internationally known to be the origin, take-off point and destination of several victims of human trafficking around the world.

Slavery was once known as ‘trading in humans’ and slave traders were often referred to as ‘man-thief’. Slavery has been abolished for over two centuries but it has morphed into another form: human trafficking or trafficking in persons. This has been attributed to a multiplicity of reasons like: lack of access to good employment and education, insecurity, lack of knowledge of human rights, debt bondage, poverty, and discrimination of minority groups.

Men, women, and children from Nigeria are trafficked to the Middle East, Europe, Asia and other African countries. In turn, victims of human trafficking from neighbouring countries such as Niger, Togo, Chad, Mali, Cameroon, and others are trafficked in Nigeria for domestic servitude, farm work, prostitution, and stone quarrying. There is also the prevalence of domestic trafficking from rural areas to urban areas such as Lagos, Ibadan, Kano, Port Harcourt, and Calabar for domestic servitude, begging, farming, organ trafficking and sexual purposes.

WHAT IS HUMAN TRAFFICKING?

Article 3 (a) & (c) of the Palermo Protocol defines “Trafficking in Persons” as:

“the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.”

“The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered “trafficking in persons” even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article.”

“Human Trafficking” and “Slavery” are often used interchangeably as they are similar, and it would be safe to call human trafficking a form of modern-day slavery. Victims of human trafficking are mostly indebted to traffickers and smugglers and are forced to work on farms, strip clubs, and peddling rings for little or no money. Slavery is a crime against humanity and under Article 7 of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, ‘crimes against

humanity' are defined to include enslavement, and this is punishable irrespective of where it occurs.

WHO ARE THE TRAFFICKERS?

Human traffickers could be private individuals or an organized crime group. These private individuals could include, friends, relatives or neighbours who are financially better than the victims of human trafficking. Sadly, most traffickers who recruit women and girls for the sex or domestic work are women who were victims of human trafficking or are currently sex workers.

Some of the manipulative practices used to coerce victims include the seizure of travel documents, threats or physical violence on victims, oath taking, threats to relations of victims, seizure of earnings of victims, restriction of movement and communication, and psychological pressure through assuring submission.

Women and Children Trafficking In Nigeria: Existing Legislation for Its Prevention

THE 1999 CONSTITUTION OF THE FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF NIGERIA AS AMENDED IN 2011

Section 34 provides that:

“Every individual is entitled to respect for the dignity of the person and accordingly; no person shall be subjected to torture or to inhuman or degrading treatment; no person shall be held in slavery or servitude; and no person shall be required to perform forced or compulsory labour.”

This promises the right to dignity of the human person and therefore prohibits the subjection of any person to slavery and servitude. Also, **section 35** provides to the effect that every person shall be entitled to his personal liberty and no person shall be deprived of such liberty save in certain circumstances stipulated in the Constitution. Though these provisions are contained in the Constitution, sadly most Nigerians are not aware of this right. **Section 46(1)** provides that anyone who alleges that his right has been or is or is about to be contravened should apply to the High Court for redress¹.

The Fundamental Rights Enforcement Procedure Rules came into being as a result of **Section 46(3)** of the Constitution and has as its objectives, shall be expansively and realizing applicant's rights and freedom². It seeks to pursue access to justice for all classes of persons particularly the poor, uneducated, vulnerable and illiterate³. The Rules encourage public interest litigation in human rights and states that no case should be struck out because of such technicalities as locus standi⁴ such that someone can bring a human right action on behalf of another⁵. Human right actions are treated as priority but

¹ Order II Rule 1

² Preamble 3(c)

³ Preamble 3(d)

⁴ Preamble 3(e)

⁵ Preamble 3(e)(ii-v)

where it has to do with liberty, it can be treated with emergency⁶. No statute of limitation can apply to human right cases⁷.

PALERMO PROTOCOL

This is fully known as the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons especially Woman and Children. It is the first universal instrument with a unified definition of trafficking in persons. It was established to prevent and combat trafficking of women and children, protect and assist victims of human trafficking, and to promote cooperation among states parties⁸. The Protocol is applicable to offences that are transnational in nature and involves an organized criminal group⁹. Nigeria signed this Protocol on 13 December 2000 and ratified same on 28 June 2001¹⁰.

In other to prevent trafficking of persons, Article 9 provides that:

1. *States parties shall establish comprehensive policies, programmes and other measures:*
 - (a) *To prevent and combat trafficking in persons; and*
 - (b) *To protect victims of trafficking in persons, especially women and children, from revictimization.*
2. *State parties shall endeavour to undertake measures such as research, information and mass media campaigns and social and economic initiatives to prevent and combat trafficking in persons.*
3. *Policies, programmes and other measures established in accordance with this article shall, as appropriate, include cooperation with non-governmental organizations, other relevant organizations, and other elements of civil society.*
4. *States Parties shall take or strengthen measures, including through bilateral or multilateral cooperation, to alleviate the factors that make persons, especially women and children, vulnerable to trafficking, such as poverty, underdevelopment, and lack of equal opportunity.*
5. *States Parties shall adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures, including through bilateral and multilateral cooperation, to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking.*

One of the weaknesses of the Protocol is that it assumes that the traffickers are crime groups. However, in Nigeria most crimes that relate to human trafficking are committed by individual who could be relatives or neighbours and not necessarily a sophisticated network.

⁶ Preamble 3(g)

⁷ Order III Rule 1

⁸Article 2 of the Palermo Protocol

⁹ Article 4

¹⁰ https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&clang=en

CRIMINAL CODE

The Criminal Code is applicable to the southern states in Nigeria. This code does not specifically define or deal with human trafficking; however, it covers offences which may constitute trafficking for slavery and prostitution. For example, **Sec. 216 of the Criminal Code** proscribes indecent treatment of boys under the age of 14 years¹¹; **Section 218** prohibits the defilement of girls under 13 years; where a householder permits the defilement of girls under the age of 13 years on his premises, he is equally guilty of a felony and liable to imprisonment for life without the option of caning¹² but where the girl is able 13 years but under the age of 16 years, such landowner is liable to 2 years imprisonment with or without caning.

Further anyone who encourages the seduction, defilement or prostitution of a girl under the age of 16 years is liable to punishment for two years¹³; where a person under the age of 16 years is allowed to reside in a brothel, whoever has custody of that child is punishable to imprisonment for six months¹⁴.

Where a person procures a girl or woman under the age of eighteen years to have unlawful carnal connection with any other person or become a prostitute whether in Nigeria or elsewhere, such person is guilty of a misdemeanor and liable to 2 years imprisonment¹⁵. The next section expands the scope and makes punishable the act of using threats, intimidation or false pretense or hard drugs to procure a women or girl for unlawful carnal knowledge in Nigeria or elsewhere for two years¹⁶.

The Criminal Code also punishes any male person who earns a living from the proceeds of prostitution¹⁷ or any person (male or female) who follows a female prostitute to control or influence her movements¹⁸. The Code makes the detention of a female in a brothel against her will with the intent that she should be unlawfully defiled¹⁹.

The dealing in slave trade in any form is prohibited in the Code by **Section 369** of its provisions. This section covers instances where a person is sold into bondage due to a debt bondage as well as where the trafficker is not even a citizen of Nigeria. Finally, the Criminal Code prohibits child stealing²⁰.

The Criminal Code is insufficient either as a preventive or punitive measure to stop women and child trafficking because:

- It does not have a specific provision that either defines or prohibits human trafficking.

¹¹ This section may be used for the offence of the use of male children for sexual trafficking although it seems that the section was created to prohibit homosexuality.

¹² **Section 219**

¹³ **Section 222A**

¹⁴ **Section 222B**

¹⁵ **Section 223**

¹⁶ **Section 224**

¹⁷ **Section 225A(1)**

¹⁸ **Section 225A(3-4)**

¹⁹ **Section 227**

²⁰ **Section 271**

- Although the defilement of girls below the age of 13 years is punishable by life imprisonment, the defilement of girls above 13 years is punishable only by 2 years imprisonment. As such, it is as though the Criminal Code deems girls above 13 years to be adults contrary to both the Child Rights Act and the Nigerian Constitution
- Further, where a person encourages the prostitution of an underage girl, it is deemed a mere misdemeanor thus underestimating the gravity of the offence of child trafficking. The position is also the same for following a woman about so as to control her movement to force her into prostitution or to detain a woman in a brothel against her will, the Criminal Code deems these as misdemeanors and prescribes two years imprisonment as punishment.
- The Criminal Code does not also take into cognizance the fact that a male could also be forced into prostitution
- The Criminal Code does not cover instances of forced labour

PENAL CODE

The Penal Code is the criminal law that governs the northern states in Nigeria. Unlike the Criminal Code, the Penal Code has a specific provision dealing with human trafficking as in **Section 281** which the heading, ‘Traffic in women’ and stating that:

“Whoever, in order to gratify the passions of another person, procures, entices or leads away, even with her consent, any woman or girl for immoral purpose shall be punished with imprisonment which may extend to seven years and shall also be liable to fine”

Aside this specific section, other section may be used to charge a person suspected to deal in human trafficking. For example, **Section 271** prohibits the kidnapping of a male below the age of 14 years and a female below the age of sixteen years. Infact, it is said to be kidnapping even whouere the child is taken with the consent of the parents but this consent was obtained by force or deceit²¹.

Where a girl is procured to go anywhere with the knowledge or intent that she will be forced to have intercourse with another, it is prohibited and punishable with 10 years imprisonment and fine²². Where a girl under the age of 21 years is imported into Northern Nigeria for forced or seduced illicit intercourse, the person who imported this girl is liable to 10 years imprisonment and fine²³. The next section expands the scope to the effect that anyone who buys, sells, hires, lets a person under the age of 18 years for prostitution is liable upon conviction to 10 years imprisonment and fine²⁴.

Slave dealing is prohibited and punishable by 14 years imprisonment and fine²⁵ while unlawful compulsory labour is punishable by 1 year imprisonment and fine²⁶.

²¹ **Section 272**

²² **Section 275**

²³ **Section 276**

²⁴ **Section 278**

²⁵ **Section 280**

²⁶ **Section 281**

The Penal Code is a useful enactment but one wonders what happens where a child is taken away with the consent of his parents or guardians for trafficking purposes like begging or hard labour²⁷. The inconsistencies in the ages of children are also easily noticeable. For example, the procurement of a girl under 18 years for prostitution is punishable but for a foreign girl, the age limit is increased to 21 years. Boys sadly have the lowest age of all- 14 years! For boys, the crime of kidnapping occurs where a boy below 15 years is taken without the consent of his guardian. Finally, the Code does not provide compensation to the victims of trafficking. It is recommended that these should be looked into.

CHILD RIGHT ACT

This Act provides a wide array of rights, care, responsibilities, and supervision for a child in Nigeria. This Act was drafted and signed into law for the purpose of adopting the Convention on the Rights of the Child. As at 2020, only 25 states out of 36 states²⁸ in Nigeria have adopted the Child Right Act in line with the 1999 Constitution of Nigeria as amended²⁹. The eleven states yet to ratify the Child Rights Act in Nigeria are Adamawa, Bauchi, Borno, Gombe, Jigawa, Kano Katsina, Kebbi, Yobe, Sokoto and Zamfara states.

The Act in **Section 25(1 & 2)** makes it an offence to expose or involve a child in the use of narcotic drugs and psycho tropic substances; or expose or involve a child in the production or trafficking of narcotic drugs or psychotropic substances and issues a penalty of life imprisonment to offenders. **Section 28** provides that no child shall be:

- (1)(a) subjected to any forced or exploitative labour; or*
- (b) employed to work in any capacity except where he is employed by a member of his family on light work of an agricultural, horticultural, or domestic character; or*
- (c) required, in any case, to lift, carry or move anything so heavy as to be likely to adversely affect his physical, mental, spiritual, moral, or social development; or*
- (d) employed as a domestic help outside his own home or family environment.*
- (2) No child shall be employed or work in an industrial undertaking and nothing in this subsection shall apply to work done by children in technical schools or similar approved institutions if the work is supervised by the appropriate authority.*
- (3) Any person who contravenes any provision of subsection (1) or (2) of this section commits an offence and is liable on conviction to a fine not exceeding fifty thousand naira or imprisonment for a term of five years or to both such fine and imprisonment.*
- (4) Where an offence under this section is committed by a body corporate, any person who at the time of the commission of the offence was a proprietor, director, general manager or other similar officer, servant or agent of the body corporate shall be deemed*

²⁷ **Section 271**

²⁸ <https://www.thisdaylive.com/index.php/2019/11/24/non-domestication-of-the-child-rights-act-by-11-northern-states-worries-unicef/>

²⁹ Section 12 provides that the State Houses of Assembly shall adopt and make their own laws.

to have jointly and severally committed the offence and may be liable on conviction to a fine of two hundred and fifty thousand naira.

Section 30(2) provides that a child shall not be used-

(a) for the purpose of begging for alms, guiding beggars, prostitution, domestic or sexual labour or for any unlawful or immoral purpose; or

(b) as a slave or for practices similar to slavery such as sale or trafficking of the child, debt bondage or serfdom and forced or compulsory labour;

(c) for hawking of goods or services on main city streets, brothels or highways;

(d) for any purpose that deprives the child of the opportunity to attend and remain in school as provided for under the Compulsory, Free Universal Basic Education Act;

(e) procured or offered for prostitution or for the production of pornography or for any pornographic performance; and

(f) procured or offered for any activity in the production or trafficking of illegal drugs and any other activity relating to illicit drugs as specified in the National Drug Law Enforcement Agency Act.

(3) A person who contravenes the provisions of subsection (1) of this section commits an offence and is liable on conviction to imprisonment for a term of ten years.

The National Child Rights Implementation Committee initiates actions that ensure the observance and popularization of the rights and welfare of a child as provided in the Act³⁰. Sadly, the Child Right Act does not cover organ trafficking in children or provide compensation of child victims. Also, compared to the NAPITP Act, the fines payable under this Act are lesser and the imprisonment ranges between 5 to 14 years.

LABOUR ACT 2004³¹

This is the Law that generally provides for protection of wages, contracts of employment and terms and conditions of employment. Certain sections also provide for protection of children from labour which can be construed as components that form child trafficking. **Section 59 (1) (a-b)** is similar to **section 28 of the Child Right Act**. Also a young person under the age of fourteen years may be employed only on a daily wage; on a day-to-day basis; and so long as he returns each night to the place of residence of his parents or guardian or a person approved by his parents or guardian³². **Section 59(6)** provides that:

“No young person shall be employed in any employment which is injurious to his health, dangerous or immoral; and, where an employer is notified in writing by the Minister (either generally or in any particular case) that the kind of work upon which a young person is employed is injurious to the young person's health, dangerous, immoral

³⁰ Section 261(1)(a)(i)

³¹ Cap L1, Laws of the Federation of Nigeria (LFN) 2004.

³² Section 59(3) of Labour Act

or otherwise unsuitable, the employer shall discontinue the employment without prejudice to the right of the young person to be paid such wages as he may have earned up to the date of discontinuance.”

Most of the provisions for the protection of women under this Act are not adhered to which leads to discrimination of women at work contrary to ratified ILO Convention 100 on Equal Remuneration.

- **The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition), Enforcement and Administration Act**

This Act was established to provide an effective and comprehensive legal and institutional framework for the prohibition, prevention, detection, prosecution and punishment of human trafficking and related offences in Nigeria; protect victims of human trafficking; and promote and facilitate national and international cooperation as provided in **Section 1 (a-c)**. The Act prohibits human trafficking in Nigeria and states in **Section 13(2)(i)** that;

“Any person who recruits, transports, transfers, harbours or receives another person by means of –

(a) threat or use of force or other forms of coercion;

(b) abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability; or

(c) giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation of that person, commits an offence and is liable on conviction to imprisonment for a term of not less than 2 years and to a fine of not less than N250,000.00.”

The Act spells out offences and penalties for offenders under the Act. **Section 14** provides that:

“Any person who - (a) imports another person into Nigeria, knowing or having reason to know that the person will be forced or induced into prostitution or other forms of exploitation in Nigeria or while in transit; or (b) exports another person from Nigeria, knowing or having reason to know, that the person will be forced or induced into prostitution or other forms of exploitation in the country to which the person is exported or while in transit; commits an offence and is liable on conviction to imprisonment for a term of not less than 5 years and to a fine of not less than N1,000,000.00.”

Section 15(b) provides that:

“Any person who by the use of force, deception, threat, coercion, debt bondage (immediate or in the near future) or any means whatsoever – (b) keeps, detains or harbours any other person with intent, knowing or having reason to know that such a person is likely to be forced or induced into prostitution or other forms of exploitation with or by any person or an animal, commits an offence and is liable on conviction to imprisonment for not less than 5 years and to a fine of not less than N500,000.00.”

Section 16(1) also provides that:

“Any person who procures or recruits any person under the age of 18 years to be subjected to prostitution or other forms of exploitation with himself, any person or

persons, either in Nigeria or anywhere else, commits an offence and shall be liable on conviction to imprisonment for a term of not less than 7 years and to a fine of not less than N1,000,000.00”.

Any person who employs, requires, recruits, transports, harbours, receives or hires out, a child under the age of 12 years as a domestic worker, commits an offence and is liable on conviction to imprisonment for a minimum term of 6 months and not exceeding 7 years as provided in **Section 23(1)**.

Trafficking in slaves is an offence under **Section 24** of the Act and a person who recruits, imports, exports, transfers, transports, buys, sells, disposes or in any way traffics in any person as a slave or accepts, receives, detains or harbours a person as a slave, commits an offence and is liable on conviction to imprisonment for a term of not less than 7 years and to a fine of not less than N2,000,000.00.

One major form of trafficking is the recruitment of women and children for the purpose of begging on the streets. The act of “begging” is not covered under this Act as a form of trafficking.

- **ILO Conventions on Forced Labour, 1930 (No. 29)**

The International Labour Organization (ILO), is a specialized UN Agency committed to the promotion of social justice and labour rights, which has several conventions related to the elimination of human trafficking and its forced labour outcomes. This Convention defines forced labour and commits member States to eradicate forced labour and prevent its occurrence. The ILO has a specific mandate to protect the rights of migrant workers.

- **The UN General Assembly Declaration on Violence against Women (1993)**

Nigeria is a signatory to this treaty and is therefore bound by the provisions therein. Article 2(b) provides that “Physical, sexual and psychological violence occurring within the general community, including rape, sexual abuse, sexual harassment and intimidation at work, in educational institutions and elsewhere, trafficking in women and forced prostitution.” Article 3 affords women the equal enjoyment and protection of all human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, social, economic, civil, cultural, or any other field.

- **The Convention on elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (1979)**

Nigeria is a signatory to this convention which contain provisions for the protection of the rights of trafficked persons. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women³³.

- **The Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography (2000)**

³³ Article 6

Nigeria is also a party to this Convention and is therefore bound by its provisions³⁴. Article 3 provides to the effect that:

“Each State Party shall ensure that, as a minimum, the following acts and activities are fully covered under its criminal or penal law, whether such offences are committed domestically or transnationally or on an individual or organized basis:

(a) In the context of sale of children as defined in article 2:

(i) Offering, delivering or accepting, by whatever means, a child for the purpose of:

- a. Sexual exploitation of the child;*
- b. Transfer of organs of the child for profit;*
- c. Engagement of the child in forced labour”.*

Organ Trafficking

The rise of organ transplantation as a medical procedure has inadvertently led to the rise of organ trafficking³⁵. This is usually because of its scarcity in comparison to its demand. As a result of this scarcity, some patients in urgent need of organ donation die while on the waiting list for an organ donor³⁶. Organs may be transplanted from either living or deceased donors. For either of these donors, consent must have been obtained³⁷. Statistics has shown that living persons are preferred as donors to deceased donors such that living donors constitute 42.5% of the donors³⁸.

Organ donations are permissible in so far as:

- Willful permission is granted i.e. consent given without coercion
- When consent is given, it must be granted with full knowledge of existing facts; such consent must be well informed³⁹
- After the willful donation of the organ, such donor must be professionally taken care of.
- The organ must be granted freely and without the hope of financial gain or monetary payment except for a refund or repayment for expenses sustained⁴⁰.

³⁴ https://web.archive.org/web/20130927163005/http://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?mtdsg_no=IV-11-c&chapter=4&lang=en

³⁵ United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Assessment Toolkit, “Trafficking in Persons for the Purpose of Organ Removal”

³⁶ Alexis A. Aronowitz and Elif Isitman, “Trafficking of Human Beings for the Purpose of Organ Removal: Are (International) Legal Instruments Effective Measures to Eradicate the Practice?” *GroJIL* 2 (2013), 76

³⁷ In the case of a deceased donor, consent may be expressed or presumed. Consent is deemed to be presumed unless there is an express refusal. But for a living donor, consent must be given expressly, willingly, without coercion or the promise of a reward.

³⁸ Professor Shima Gyoh, “Human Organ Sales: Regulating Against The Racketeers” *Africa Health* November 2014 Available at: <http://africa-health.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/4.-Shimas-Opinion1.pdf> Accessed 23 August 2020 7:33am; Alexis et al *ibid* pg. 76-77

³⁹ **Guiding Principle 3** of the World Health Organization Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation

⁴⁰ **Guiding Principle 5** of the World Health Organization Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation; **Article 21** of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin; **Article 21** of the Council of Europe Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine

- The donor must be an adult (i.e above the age of 18 years)⁴¹

The definition of organ trafficking is also included in the general definition of human trafficking as shown in **Article 3(a) of the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children**⁴² to mean

‘...the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation⁴³. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs’.

The elements of the offence of organ trafficking is included in its definition to be:

- The act: that is the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons
- The means: that is, through the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person
- The purpose: the removal of organs

For organ trafficking to occur, there must be a fusion or act, means and purpose⁴⁴. Further, it must be noted that there can be no true consent if any of the means stated above is used⁴⁵ nor can a minor give consent⁴⁶.

Organ trafficking violates every rule of organ donation. The United Nations have given up hope of attempting to estimate the number of persons who have been victims of organ trafficking⁴⁷. Generally, it is an established fact that the victims of human trafficking come from countries that has its citizens living in poverty. It is therefore unsurprising that a country like Nigeria described as “the poverty capital of the world”⁴⁸ is a source, transit and destination for the crime of organ

⁴¹ Recommendations of the 2004 Consensus Statement of the Amsterdam Forum on the Care of the Living Donor

⁴² Hereinafter referred as to The Palermo Protocol

⁴³ **Section 13 of The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act**

⁴⁴ This is important because it is possible for someone to be transported from one point to another point that would constitute smuggling and not trafficking as there was no purpose for exploitation.

⁴⁵ Thus, where someone donates his organs without the element of force present but there is a promise of compensation or gain, it still constitutes trafficking. This is important for such countries as Nigeria where there is a high level of illiteracy. **Article 3(b) of the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children; Section 13(5) of The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act**

⁴⁶ **Article 3(c) of the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children; Section 13(6) of The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act**

⁴⁷ Alexis et al pg. 75

⁴⁸ Obadiah Mailafia “Poverty Capital of the World” *Business Day* November 15, 2019. Available at: <https://businessday.ng/columnist/article/poverty-capital-of-the-world/amp>. Accessed 05/06/20 11:45pm

trafficking. The price of an organ may be as high as \$262,000⁴⁹. It is no wonder that many people succumb to the allure of selling their kidneys in a country where most of its citizenry live on less than \$1 a day⁵⁰. Others become victims of organ trafficking through a fraudulent job offers⁵¹. Yet others are victims when they travel to foreign hospitals for medical treatment due to the deplorable state of the health sector in the country and their organs are taken without their consent or knowledge⁵². In Nigeria, children have had their organs removed by foreigners who come under humanitarian auspices to adopt these children and take them abroad only to take them abroad to remove their organs⁵³.

Illiteracy has a huge role to play in the continued perpetration of human trafficking as some of the victims are told lies such as: ‘the organ to be taken is the sleepy organ or is the smaller organ⁵⁴’ or ‘the organ to be taken will grow again⁵⁵’. The continued state of insecurity in the country is a fertile ground for victims to look for greener pastures leading them right into the waiting hands of traffickers⁵⁶.

EXISTING NIGERIAN LAWS ON ORGAN TRAFFICKING⁵⁷

The 1999 Nigerian Constitution (as amended 2011)

The 1999 Nigerian Constitution (as amended 2011) is the supreme law of the land such that any law that is inconsistent with any of its provisions is null and void to the extent of its

⁴⁹ Rafiu Oriyomi Ajakaye, “Nigerians warned against organ traffickers” *Anadolu Agency* April 8 2019 Available at: <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/africa/nigerians-warned-against-organ-traffickers/1445802#> Accessed 25/08/2020 16:22pm

⁵⁰⁵⁰ Mayowa Tijani, “Did you know Nigeria’s poverty line is less than a dollar a day?” *The Cable* May 05, 2020 Available at: https://www.thecable.ng/did-you-know-nigerias-poverty-line-is-less-than-a-dollar-a-day?_cf_chl_jschl_tk_=6e12d52c2605b45c9036411734223b29d2f3a25b-1598370354-0-ATaun4JnieeU-nYv9_KpodrODXIIpniLAdV_3PfZVJjiSPF_f8NXgzvD0PTIKIzIrGVwZx1BQwfv_JOoLEqxJ3GM1kTr9FulUz0_Q2zkAnTB6eN7II_kSgCf_SM5oq0jPs-69c62xXpXDoNkuyBJJI0wamZMztJI4EFD_WRt8OeZA2FPe_vkmg4gpM3ZCvoG4SNLaEvTOEmg_jX99ArqtOx_7LXDzsqeGF5GYth76cTqpodfH3a679ZdpxK1rOBm0WAMzS4TdXslvJ4hJw4GKhkjEHJMZ2pq2YGllqg3qu_hrQ_MfNW7DvFVu3Yd3GsJ_0k0elkGd_UtIsqaFPy5eKxbEsbZk-p_f3klaihs-RHZtg Accessed August 25, 2020 16:56pm. Women can go to fertility clinics to sell their ovaries for as little as N140,000 (\$363) Abdullateef Aliyu, “How Trafficked Nigerians Fall Victims of Organ Harvest in Europe” *Daily Trust* July 18, 2019 Available at: <https://dailytrust.com/how-trafficked-nigerians-fall-victims-of-organ-harvest-in-europe> Accessed August 25, 2020 16:54pm

⁵¹ Rafiu Oriyomi supra

⁵² Shakirudeen Taiwo, “What you need to know about human organ trafficking in Africa” *Business Insider by Pulse* October 18, 2017 Available at: <https://www.pulse.ng/bi/lifestyle/lifestyle-what-you-need-to-know-about-human-organ-trafficking-in-africa/w4vt5kz> Accessed August 25, 2020 16:33pm

⁵³ Osita Agbu, “Revisiting Corruption and Human Trafficking in Nigeria: Any Progress” Available at: <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.482.8366&rep=rep1&type=pdf> Accessed 26 August 2020 16:56pm

⁵⁴ UNODC Trafficking Assessment Toolkit pg. 30

⁵⁵ Alexis et al pg. 81

⁵⁶ Human Rights Watch, “ ‘You Pray for Death’: Trafficking in Women and Girls in Nigeria” (2019) Human Rights Watch Available at: https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/report_pdf/nigeria0819.pdf Accessed 25 August 2020 1:52pm

⁵⁷ Efforts have been made to distinguish between organ trafficking and trafficking in persons for the purpose of organ removal by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime in its Assessment Toolkit *ibid.* But in this article, no such distinction is made.

inconsistency⁵⁸. The Constitution provided for the fundamental right of every individual to dignity⁵⁹.

Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act (2015)⁶⁰

Nigeria is one of the few countries on the African continent with a specific anti-trafficking law: The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act promulgated in 2003 but was amended in 2015 to reflect the new trends in human trafficking.

The Act does not define human trafficking but instead prohibits ‘acts of human trafficking’⁶¹ which is similar to the definition of human trafficking as stated in the Palermo Protocol. **Section 20** deals specifically with organ trafficking termed as ‘organ harvesting’ in this section. This section does not merely criminalise such acts as the enlistment or transportation or delivery of victims of human trafficking but also the accommodation of a victim for the purpose of organ harvesting⁶². The punishment for the commission of this is a term of imprisonment of not less than 7 years and a fine of N5,000,000⁶³.

The Act also recognizes the peculiarity of the Nigerian socio-economic climate and the use of human organs for ritual purposes whether for power, protection or wealth and goes on to prohibit same in **Section 20(2)**. This section proscribes the procuring, offering or assistance in the removal or buying or selling of human organs⁶⁴. Where an offender is convicted, he is liable to not less than 7 years imprisonment and a fine of N5,000,000. The punishment is the same where a child is the victim of organ trafficking⁶⁵.

The Act also places a responsibility on transportation agencies (air, sea) as well as tour operators and travel agents to stop the spread of human trafficking through their transportation system⁶⁶.

Criminal Code Act

The Criminal Code Act prohibits the offence of kidnapping⁶⁷; it also prohibits the deprivation of the liberty of a person⁶⁸; stealing⁶⁹; robbery⁷⁰; rashness or negligence in the performance of surgical operations⁷¹.

⁵⁸ **Section 1(1) and (3)** of its provisions

⁵⁹ **Section 34 of the 1999 Nigerian Constitution (as amended 2011)**

⁶⁰ Hereinafter referred to as “The Act”

⁶¹ **Section 13 of the Act**

⁶² **Section 20(1)(b) of the Act**

⁶³ Five million naira. **Section 20(1)(b) of the Act**

⁶⁴ **Section 20(2)(a-b) of the Act**; NAN, “NAPTIP investigates human organ trafficking in Nigeria” *Punch Nigeria* 29 October 2017 Available at: <https://punchng.com/naptip-investigates-human-organ-harvesting-in-nigeria/> Accessed 25 August 2020 16:10pm

⁶⁵ **Section 20(3) of the Act**

⁶⁶ **Section 35 of the Act**

⁶⁷ **Section 364 of the Criminal Code Act**

⁶⁸ **Section 365 of the Criminal Code Act**

⁶⁹ Where a person’s organ like kidney or liver is taken without his/her consent, it can be termed stealing. Thankfully, the Criminal Code defined stealing to include making the property of a person moveable for the purpose of stealing it. **Section 382-383 of the Criminal Code Act**

⁷⁰ Stealing with the threat or use of violence **Section 401-402 of the Criminal Code Act**

Recommendations

The haunting specter of human trafficking continues to hang over us although it has been 19 (nineteen years) since it ratified the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime was ratified by the Nigerian Legislature. Further, although the Nigeria has a specific legislation against human trafficking as in: The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act, this enactment is fraught with a lot of deficiencies.

Our recommendations would be grouped under the subheadings: Prevent, Punish and Protect

1. **PREVENT:** The age-old proverb still stands true: “Prevention is better than cure”. Prevention of human trafficking may be done through:
 - a. **Raising awareness:** Human trafficking has its stronghold in deception or ignorance. The methods and deception of human traffickers should be exposed to the public as a preventive measure and put in display in public places such as in airports, bus parks, embassies, sea ports, the borders of States as well as the border between Nigeria and other countries. This notice should be in plain language, conspicuous and in as many languages as possible.
 - b. **Promote healthy living:** Nigeria should join the increasing league of countries that are promulgating policies that promotes the healthy living of its citizenry⁷². This may be done through various means: promoting of sports; programmes that encourage an active lifestyle; the ban on certain foods that have a harmful effect on one’s organs; reduction on prices of healthy and nutritious foods and creating awareness on the effect that certain foods have on the body.
 - c. **Economic empowerment:** The saying of the wise King that: “A rich man’s wealth is his strong city; the poverty of the poor is their ruin”⁷³ is particularly true in the fight against human trafficking. The government should create more empowerment schemes for its citizenry to attack human trafficking at its roots. This economic empowerment scheme should be widespread, covering every local government and reaching into the rural areas. This is important because the rural areas do not usually get carried along because of a combination of illiteracy, poor communication networks and road networks.

⁷¹ Section 343(1)(e) of the Criminal Code Act

⁷² Yevgeniy Goryakin, Sabine Vuik and Michele Cecchino, “Promoting healthier diets and active lifestyles: Policies and Best Practices” *OECD iLibrary* Available at: <https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/2f7cd1bf-en/index.html?itemId=/content/component/2f7cd1bf-en> Accessed 25 August 2020 3:38pm

⁷³ Proverbs 10:15

- d. Training of law enforcement agencies: This cannot be overemphasized. Law enforcement agencies should be trained to recognize the signs of trafficking and the most effective ways of preventing it. Law enforcement agents must also be trained to track fraudulently online posts inviting persons to either sell their organs or work in a foreign country⁷⁴. Law enforcement agencies must learn to identify the ever shifting shape of human trafficking and adapt their strategies to prevent its continuations.

The law enforcement agents may be trained through workshops, trainings and seminars with experts in various fields and in collaboration with experts from other countries that are successfully dealing with the problem of human trafficking in their own country.

- e. Whistle blowers: One of the problems facing the fight against human trafficking is corruption and an ineffective whistle blowing system. Whistle blowing should be encouraged at various levels in Nigeria:
- Within communities: Whistle blowing can be encouraged within a community such that if a person is known to recruit persons from a particular community to take abroad in promise of a foreign job, this person may be reported to the police or any law enforcement for investigations to ascertain the validity of this foreign job.
 - Within the law enforcement agencies: Reports are rife about the cooperation between the law enforcement agencies and traffickers such that a bribe can cause the law enforcement agents to turn a blind eye to an apparent case of human trafficking⁷⁵. Whistle blowing would encourage these corrupt officials and serve as a deterrent to others.
- f. Develop country's health sector: The Coronavirus exposed the dilapidated state of the Nigerian's health sector. As a result of this, some patient resort to travelling abroad to get treated properly and fall victims to trafficking. Investing in and developing the health sector of the country will prevent these health expedition and reduce the incidence of trafficking.
- g. Promote education: The purpose of education is to dispel the darkness of ignorance and illiteracy. Promoting education will teach children that one kidney

⁷⁴ OCCRP, 'Selling my kidneys on Facebook' *OCCRP* August 21, 2013 Available at: <https://www.occrp.org/en/investigations/2123-selling-my-kidney-on-facebook> Accessed 25th August 2020 3:32pm

⁷⁵ Osita Agbu, "Corruption and Human Trafficking: The Nigerian Case" *West Africa Review* ©ISSN: 1094-2254 Vol. 4, No. 1 (2003) Available at: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/ab84/544291af64bdd21d4d99ea4e68ea4c7f26cd.pdf> Accessed 26 August 2020 17:07pm; Tobore Ovuorie, " INVESTIGATION: Inside Nigeria's Ruthless Human Trafficking Mafia" *Premium Times Opinion* Available at: <https://app.premiumtimesng.com/> Accessed 25 August 2020 11:53am

is not 'sleepy' or that an organ can grow back⁷⁶. Education will make people suitable for the labour market and reduce the need to travel abroad to work as a domestic staff worker.

In some states of the United States, racial diversity has been inculcated in the curriculum of schools⁷⁷. This should also be done in Nigeria and the subject of human trafficking should be compulsorily taught to pupils at all levels of education. To achieve this, education has to be free and compulsorily such that 'street children' or 'al-majiri' do not fall prey to human traffickers.

- h. The role of religious and community leaders: Another hold that traffickers have over their victims is the use of juju or voodoo to convince them that if they try to escape, the juju will haunt them. This is where religious and community leaders come in. In Nigeria, it is believed that traditional leaders have their authority vested in them by the gods. Also, religious leaders are seen to have their power given to them by God. As such, these leaders can offer prayers to break curses⁷⁸ accruing to the victim by virtue of the fact that they have escaped their traffickers. This will go a lot way in improving the psychological health of these victims.

Further, religious and community leaders usually play the part of advisers to their congregation/members. As such, these leaders should be trained to recognize potential trafficking cases so as to advise their members from desisting from an ill-fated journey in cases of fraudulent job offers abroad or a desire to sell an organ.

- i. Improve the security of the citizenry: Traffickers take advantage of insecurity in a locality to kidnap prisoners of war or the survivors of a conflict or banditry. This is why security is very important. The rise of banditry and the ensuing kidnappings is a source of worry as the use of children as soldiers by the Boko Haram insurgents⁷⁹ and the forcing of women captured into marriage or slavery⁸⁰ is still fresh in our memory.

⁷⁶ Alexis et al ibid

⁷⁷ Valerie Strauss, "'Teaching for Black Lives' — a handbook to fight America's ferocious racism in (virtual or face-to-face) classrooms" *Washington Post* June 1, 2020 Available at: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/education/2020/06/01/teaching-black-lives-handbook-fight-americas-ferocious-racism-virtual-or-face-to-face-classrooms/> Accessed 27 August 2020 11:43am

⁷⁸ Simon Ebegbulem, "'Our gods will destroy you"; Oba of Benin curse human traffickers" *Vanguard Newspaper* March 10, 2018 Available at: <https://www.vanguardngr.com/2018/03/gods-will-destroy-oba-benin-curse-human-traffickers/> Accessed 27 August 2020 11:53am

⁷⁹ Vesna Markovic, "Suicide Squad: Boko Haram's Use of the Female Suicide Bomber" *Taylor and Francis Online* July 16 2019 Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/08974454.2019.1629153?scroll=top&needAccess=true&journalCode=wcj20> Accessed 27 August 2020 11:28am

- j. Collaboration with the media and entertainment industry: This is a continuation as to the need to raise public awareness. The media is often referred to by some as “the fourth arm of government” because of the power it has to mould public opinion. The media should engage in massive dissemination about information concerning public awareness. This also applies to the entertainment industry. Movie stars and music artistes should use their position of influence to educate the masses about human trafficking through songs or drama.

- k. Opening and publication of traffickers’ registry: The increase in the number of rape cases and the use of violence by rapists led to the decision by the Chairman of Nigerian Governors’ Forum to open a rapist register in Ekiti State to shame rapists as well as prevent further incidences of rape⁸¹. It is our contention that a similar register should be opened for trafficker to shame these traffickers as well as warn the public to steer clear of these trafficker and be wary of any of their offers.

- l. Special protection for vulnerable persons (i.e. persons living with disabilities): Persons living with disabilities are at disadvantage and traffickers take advantage of these people. Special attention must be given to persons living with disabilities to protect them from traffickers. These may take various forms like education, empowerment, providing and equipping homes for persons living with disabilities.

- m. Encouraging more channels of organ donation: Nigeria should adopt the principle of presumed consent of a deceased donor so as to increase the channels where organs may be donated or harvested legally. This would reduce the waiting time of patients in need of an organ. Others have suggested that donation by living persons for a fee with a full well-informed consent and proper post-operation medical care will reduce the illegal trade in organ harvesting⁸².

⁸⁰ Diana Chandler, “148 Boko Haram sex slaves, forced laborers rescued” *Baptist Press* June 5 2018 Available at: <https://www.baptistpress.com/resource-library/news/148-boko-haram-sex-slaves-forced-laborers-rescued/> Accessed 27 August 2020 11:34am

⁸¹ Vanguard News Nigeria, “Fayemi declares no more mercy, bail for rapists in Ekiti” *Vanguard News* June 6, 2020 Available at: <https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwjXrpLbm7nrAhVLT8AKHRsSCCMOFjAAegQIBBAB&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.vanguardngr.com%2F2020%2F06%2Ffayemi-declares-no-more-mercy-bail-for-rapists-in-ekiti%2F&usq=AOvVaw2vh68Sxd0Xl6ZTJbpXYeXW> Accessed 26 August 2020 17:03pm

⁸² Alexis et al; Adebambo Mariam Oladehinde, “Human Trafficking: Organ trade” *International Bar Association* August 9, 2019 Available at: <https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwjpcyEp>

- n. A toll-free emergency number: There exists ‘emergency numbers’ provided by the National Agency for the Prevention of Trafficking in Persons⁸³. However, these numbers are not publicized. Further, these numbers are not toll-free. Human trafficking is a global emergency. The same way Coronavirus was treated with urgency should be the same way human trafficking should be treated. The emergency numbers should be published with catchy words and tunes. These numbers should also be made toll-free so that the poorest of the poor would be able to reach out.
- o. Encourage bilateral and multilateral states: The essence of this is to avoid a situation where a Nigeria becomes “too hot” for traffickers and they move their base and operations towards another country. Also, where other countries establish laws to prevent and punish human trafficking, issues of jurisdiction and extradition are effectively dealt with.

2. PUNISH

- a. Strengthen existing legislations: The deficiencies in the existing legislations should be attended to and such legislation amended to be able to deal with the new trends in human trafficking. One quality of a good legislation is that it must be publicized⁸⁴. The average Nigerian does not know there is the law and because of this ignorance, cannot often fly to the law for refuge.
- b. Remove bottlenecks: In the prosecution and punishment of human trafficking offences, judicial bottlenecks should be removed. Although The Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act to adopt all legitimate measures to avoid unnecessary delays⁸⁵, this is not the actual situation in practice. As a result of this, NAPTIP has begun clamoring for a special Court⁸⁶.
- c. Train: In the prosecution of offences, the Prosecutors must be effectively trained in criminal substantive and procedural law to be able to understand the nuances and the latest position of the law so that a case is not lost as a result of technicalities.

[LvRAhXJIMMAKHYNUDhEQFjAAegOJARAB&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.ibanet.org%2FArticle%2FNewDetail.aspx%3FArticleUid%3D224C964C-15FF-46FA-B23F-BDE2659D43FB&usg=AOvVaw1RHyd_YsRIOWChyRSpN3JY](https://www.ibanet.org/Article/NewDetail.aspx?ArticleUid%3D224C964C-15FF-46FA-B23F-BDE2659D43FB&usg=AOvVaw1RHyd_YsRIOWChyRSpN3JY) Accessed August 21, 2020 4:48pm

⁸³ Hereinafter referred to as NAPTIP

⁸⁴ Dworkin, Ronald M., "Philosophy, Morality and Law – Observations Prompted by Professor Fuller’s Novel Claim" (1965). *Faculty Scholarship Series. Paper 3613*. Available at: http://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/fss_papers/3613 Accessed 26 August 2020 16:34pm

⁸⁵ **Section 37 of the Act**

⁸⁶ Seun Okinbaloye , Interview with Ebun-Olu Adegboruwa, Senior Advocate of Nigeria Channels Television (Lagos 26 August 2020)

- d. Harmonization of legislations: Existing legislation must be harmonized to avoid a conflict of laws. For instance, as regards the issue of child pornography⁸⁷ punishable under **Sec.17(1)(a) of the Act** with a term of 7 years imprisonment and a fine of N1,000,000 (One million naira), an offender may have an extra year imprisonment if the child was stupefied with the use of hard drugs to enable such child commit the sexual act for the purposes of pornography⁸⁸.

Similarly, the **Cyber Crimes Act** prohibits child pornography in **Section 23 of its provisions**. The punishment for the producing, offering or distributing child pornography under the **Cyber Crimes Act** is 10 years imprisonment or N20,000,000 (Twenty million naira) or both fine and imprisonment. A person who procures or possesses child pornography sets himself up for 5 years imprisonment or N10,000,000 (Ten million naira) or both fine and imprisonment. Where a person grooms a child for the purposes of engaging in sexual activities with the child; or with the use of force or taking advantage of the vulnerable position or an abuse of the position of trust; or recruits, coerces or forces a child to engage in pornographic activity is a criminal offender. Such a person may be liable to a term of not more than 15 years imprisonment or a fine of not more than N25,000,000 naira.

In view of these inconsistent punishments over the same issue of child pornography, this may lead to a conflict of laws. It is recommended that there should be an harmonization of these laws

3. PROTECT

- a. Privacy: The privacy of trafficked victims should be protected. This should be done in such a way that there is a balance between the need to inform the public about the progress of a trial and the psychological effect and stigmatization that might come upon the victim of trafficking.
- b. Rehabilitation: NAPTIP has done a lot to rehabilitate traffic victims and reintegrate them into society in accordance with **Guideline 2.2.2** of the Guidelines on National Referral Mechanism for Protection and Assistance to Trafficked Persons. However, the time limit for a victim to stay in any of the care centers is only for a period of 6(six) weeks. Six weeks is not often enough for a traumatized victim to recover from the trauma of trafficking or be stabilized to face the world again. It is recommended that the time frame be extended to ensure full and total recovery
- c. Remove stigmatization: There should be public education and awareness to the effect that human trafficking can happen to anybody and as such, survivors of human trafficking should be lauded as heroes and not stigmatized.

⁸⁷ That is, the procurement, recruitment, use or offering of a child for child pornography

⁸⁸ **Section 17(2) of the Act**

- d. The role of religious and community leaders: Religious and community leaders can help in the healing and reintegration process of victims of human trafficking. They can help welcome back “the lost sheep into the fold” and care for the wounds of this sheep through counseling and prayers.

- e. The role of corporate organisations: Business organisations should be encouraged to include human trafficking as part of their corporate social responsibility. This might be done by creating a quota for the employment of a victim of human trafficking as a staff of the organization.
Alternatively, business organization can provide scholarships for the education of these victims to make them useful to themselves and the society at large.

Conclusions

Human trafficking is evil, insidious and multi-faceted. A proper enforcement of the laws would lead to the eradication of the scourge of human trafficking.